

Minutes of a Meeting of the **PLANNING AND CONSULTATION COMMITTEE** held at the Town Hall, Swanage on **MONDAY 6th JANUARY 2020** at **6.30 p.m.**

Chair: -

Councillor A Harris Swanage Town Council

Present: -

Councillor M Bonfield Swanage Town Council

Councillor C Finch Swanage Town Council

Councillor J Page Swanage Town Council

Councillor N Rogers Swanage Town Council

Councillor M Whitwam Swanage Town Council

Also in attendance: -

Councillor T Foster Swanage Town Council

Councillor W Trite Swanage Town Council

Miss N Clark Administration & Communications Manager

Mrs E Evans Management Support Officer

There were eleven members of the public present at the meeting.

Public Participation Time

There were no matters raised.

1) **Apologies**

There were no apologies to report for inability to attend the Meeting.

2) **Declarations of Interest**

Members were invited to declare their interests and consider any requests for Grants of Dispensations in accordance with paragraphs 9 – 13 of the Council's Code of Conduct and regulations made under chapter 7 of the Localism Act 2011.

There were no declarations to record on this occasion.

Planning

3) **Plans for consideration**

Delegated Applications

Further to Standing Order No. 12) a) viii, it was proposed by the Chair and AGREED:-

That Items 3, 16, 5 and 12 on the Planning List be brought forward to Items 1, 2, 3 and 4 respectively.

During consideration of the following four planning applications the Chair invoked Standing Order No.1 p. to briefly suspend the meeting on a number of occasions so as to allow members of the public to address the Committee, and respond to questions regarding/relevant to the applications.

- * 6/2019/0648 **3 De Moulham Road, Swanage, BH19 1NP**
Demolish existing dwelling, and erect four new houses with off street parking and gardens.
Satao Group Ltd & Mr Abbott

OBSERVATION: The Committee strongly recommends refusal and wishes to express its concern regarding the loss of a unique building of ‘iconic’ quality, which is being replaced by four properties which are significantly different, and the continued loss of character in the town through redevelopment. Further concerns are raised as follows:-

- **Adverse impact on the street scene and character of the area - as defined in the STCA Part 04.12 Mixed Pre- and Post-war Housing –** Threats: ‘Intensification of development through infilling or development of existing plots at greater densities could harm the suburban character.
- **Layout and density of building design** - the proposal is considered to be overdevelopment and would be out of keeping with/detrimental to the important street scene and character of the area.
- **Adverse impact on nature conservation** – in relation to the loss of garden/grounds, (concerns have previously been raised with the planning authority regarding the infilling of gardens), which could have an adverse impact on local wildlife.
- **Local housing need** – the proposal is not in accordance with the Swanage Local Plan Policy SHM: Swanage Housing Mix, Paragraphs 11 and 186, and Creating opportunities for young people, Paragraph 114, as this proposal makes no provision for affordable housing, and does not ‘support sustainable community growth to provide for the needs of local residents’ as stated in the Purbeck Local Plan.

Although Committee Members recognised that the area covered by the following policy did not extend as far as 3 De Moulham Road, the property was in very close proximity to it, the whole area forming part of the De Moulham Estate:-

Swanage Local Plan Policy STCD: Swanage Townscape Character and Development

- **Areas of distinctive local character** – ‘The four areas of distinctive local character are shown on Map 9. These areas include a variety of townscape character types and new development should protect and enhance the distinctive local characteristics of these areas: The areas to the north and south of Beach Gardens are characterised by predominantly detached properties, of modest size, individual design and usually set within reasonably generous plots. The area displays a distinctive pattern of connecting roads or cul-de-sacs running back at right angles from De Moulham Road. It is important that new development does not reduce the spacious character of this area and the informal qualities of the backland areas.’

Although not a material planning consideration, comments are made that the developer needs to be made aware of the De Moulham Trust covenants that are extant on this property.

It was proposed by Councillor Whitwam, seconded by Councillor Bonfield and RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY:-

That a request be made to Councillor Trite as a Member of Dorset Council’s Eastern Area Planning Committee to recommend that planning application No. 6/2019/0648 be reassigned to the Planning Committee for careful consideration at a future Committee Meeting, and that it would be vital for the Committee to undertake a site visit prior to the meeting.

* 6/2019/0702

1A Battlemead, Swanage, BH19 1PH

Demolition of garages serving 1A Battlemead. Install dormer on front roof slope, and clad exterior. Internal alterations. Sever plot and erect new dwelling with parking, and new dropped kerb access.

Mr Streams

OBSERVATION: The Committee strongly recommends refusal and expresses its disappointment that the developer has submitted an application for an additional property on the plot so soon after already obtaining approval for one dwelling on the plot under planning application No. 6/2019/0492. The Committee reiterates its previously submitted comments which it feels remain relevant to this new proposal:-

Swanage Local Plan Policy STCD: Swanage Townscape Character and Development:

- **195.** ‘The area of Cauldon Avenue, Battlemead, Vivian Park and Bonfields Avenue to the north and Beach Gardens and Gannetts Park to the south also forms an area of distinctive local character and new development in this area should not reduce the existing suburban character.’
- **Areas of distinctive local character** – ‘The four areas of distinctive local character are shown on Map 9. These areas include a variety of townscape character types and new development should protect and enhance the distinctive local characteristics of these areas: The areas to the north and south of Beach Gardens are characterised by predominantly detached properties, of modest size, individual design and usually set within reasonably generous plots. The area displays a distinctive pattern of connecting roads or cul-de-sacs running back at right angles from De Moulham Road. It is important that new development does not reduce the spacious character of this area and the informal qualities of the backland areas.’
- **Adverse impact on the street scene and character of the area - as defined in the STCA Part 04.12 Mixed Pre- and Post-war Housing** – Threats: ‘Intensification of development through infilling or development of existing plots at greater densities could harm the suburban character.’ The proposal is considered to be overdevelopment and would be detrimental to the important street scene and character of the area. Concerns are raised that although local policies are in place to protect and preserve the character of the area, these appear not to be given any weight in the decision making process.

Potential adverse impact on neighbour amenity, overlooking and loss of privacy – being so close to the boundary of neighbouring property 1A Battlemead.

Adverse impact on nature conservation – the loss of a sizeable area of existing greenspace, which could have an adverse impact on local wildlife.

Purbeck Local Plan - Policy H14: Second homes – crucially the Committee would wish to be reassured that any approved scheme would be subject to Policy H14.

It was proposed by Councillor Bonfield, seconded by Councillor Whitwam and **RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY:-**

That a request be made to Councillor Trite as a Member of Dorset Council’s Eastern Area Planning Committee to recommend that planning application

No. 6/2019/0702 be reassigned to the Planning Committee for careful consideration at a future Committee Meeting, and that it would be vital for the Committee to undertake a site visit prior to the meeting.

- 6/2019/0654 **4A Ulwell Road, Swanage, BH19 1LH**
Replacement rear extension including the addition of new windows and rooflight. Modifications to existing porch and creation of first floor front terrace. Landscaping to terrace existing garden.
Mr Neville
OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to a satisfactory ground stability assessment being undertaken/provided.
- 6/2019/0685 **Land adjacent to 41 Jubilee Road, Swanage, BH19 2SE**
Erect partly underground single storey dwelling.
Mr Puckett
OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to adherence to the Design and Conservation Officer's Report, and subject to provision of a satisfactory Construction Management Plan to mitigate any potential adverse impact on neighbours during the building works.
- 6/2019/0602 **Driftwood, Park Road, Swanage, BH19 2AB**
Remove existing garage doors, block up opening and insert new window. Form ground floor en suite bathroom below current decking. Erect first floor balcony. Form two light wells to basement, and erect lean-to porch.
Mr Mortimer
OBSERVATION: No objection.
- 6/2019/0625 **Land to the west of York Cottage, Russell Avenue, Swanage, BH19 2ED**
Demolish existing annexe, and erect a new dwelling and detached garage.
Mr Petrie
OBSERVATION: No objection.
- 6/2019/0649 **Swanage Coastal Park, Priests Way, Swanage, Dorset, BH19 2RS**
Change of use of land from use for touring caravans and tents to use for the siting of an additional five holiday lodge caravans, and amend layout approved under planning permission 6/2018/0227 (Change of use of land from use for touring caravans and tents to use for the siting of seven holiday lodge caravans on an extended terrace with associated access, parking, lighting and relocation of the existing water tank).
Shorefield Holidays Ltd
OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to adherence to the Public Rights of Way Officer's Report prior to commencement of the proposed works.
- 6/2019/0658 **11 Redcliffe Road, Swanage, BH19 1LZ**
Erect an extension and convert loft. Erect a new double garage.
Mr Morgan
OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to mitigation of any neighbours' concerns received regarding potential adverse impact on neighbour amenity, overlooking and loss of privacy.
- 6/2019/0666 **1 Ballard Road, Swanage, BH19 1NG**

Single storey front extension, and increase roof height to form first floor accommodation with new dormer and rooflights. Demolish existing conservatory and construct terrace. New dropped kerb to form new vehicular access.

Mr & Mrs Stephen

OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to mitigation of any neighbours' concerns received regarding potential adverse impact on neighbour amenity, overlooking and loss of privacy (neighbour consultation is still open until 12th January 2020).

* 6/2019/0674

22 Station Road, Swanage, BH19 1AE

Erect two internally illuminated fascia, one non illuminated fascia, and one internally illuminated projection sign.

Well Pharmacy

OBSERVATION: No objection.

6/2019/0676

Land adjoining 11 Bell Street, Swanage, BH19 2RY

Create new dwelling on surplus land and garden.

Mr & Mrs Scott

OBSERVATION: The Committee strongly recommends refusal and feels that the unsympathetic design of the proposed dwelling is considered to be significantly out of keeping with the character of the Herston Village area, as defined in the Swanage Townscape Character Appraisal (STCA) Part 04.19, and its setting within the Herston Conservation Area, in close proximity to Listed Buildings.

The Committee reiterates its previously submitted comments regarding refused planning applications 6/2018/0296 (four new dwellings – dismissed at Appeal) and 6/2018/0459 (two new dwellings – allowed at Appeal with conditions). Committee Members feel that the reasons for dismissal (of the four dwellings) as set out in the Planning Inspector's Reports dated 19th August 2019 remain relevant to this new proposal. Further concerns are raised as follows:

- **Layout and density of building design** - considered to be overdevelopment in a limited space, with access to the proposed new dwellings being only via a narrow public footpath and an alleyway. In this context concerns are raised regarding problems arising from the construction period of any works, e.g. noise, dust, plant, hours of working, and how this would also be managed through the narrow footpath/alleyway.
- **Adverse impact on nature conservation interests** - in relation to the loss of a sizeable area of garden, and potential loss of mature trees, which would have an adverse impact on local wildlife – as identified in the STCA Part 04.19 – 'insensitive redevelopment and/or infill resulting in the loss of trees or vegetation', and 'redevelopment of plots or infill development at higher densities could adversely impact on the character of the area'.
- **Lack of parking facilities/no vehicular access to the proposed new Properties** - including potential issues which could be faced by the emergency services, and extremely limited on-street parking in the surrounding area.
- **Archaeological assessment** – comments are made that Bell Street is one of the oldest streets in Swanage and is of particular historic and archaeological interest. Committee Members therefore recommend that

an archaeological assessment of the 'surplus land' and garden should be undertaken prior to a decision being made on the application.

- 6/2019/0677 **6 Purbeck Terrace Road, Swanage, BH19 2DE**
Demolish existing lean-to kitchen and garage extension, and erect replacement single storey, mono pitched roof extension. Erect a new flat roof single storey side extension.
Mr Norman
OBSERVATION: No objection. However, concerns are expressed regarding the poor design/visual appearance of the proposed flat roof which is considered to be out of keeping with the pitched roofs of this terrace of distinctive character properties in Purbeck Terrace Road.
- 6/2019/0684 **The Chart House, 9 Bon Accord Road, Swanage, BH19 2DN**
Demolish two front porches and replace. Erect a single storey front extension, and two single storey rear extensions. Construct larger dormer to front elevation. Erect a single storey extension to pool house.
Mr Rudin & Ms Barnes
OBSERVATION: No objection.
- 6/2019/0687 **114 Priests Road, Swanage, BH19 2RR**
Erect a single storey rear extension.
Mr & Mrs Mutter
OBSERVATION: No objection.
- 6/2019/0690 **4 Russell Avenue, Swanage, BH19 2EB**
Variation of condition 2 of planning permission 6/2019/0045 (Sever garden and erect a single storey dwelling with detached garage and car port, accessed via existing entrance) to omit log store and glass balustrade in front of bedrooms, adjust land levels around the building and minor changes to windows.
Mr Jaggs
OBSERVATION: No objection.
- 6/2019/0699 **31 Prospect Crescent, Swanage, BH19 1BD**
Remove side (east) porch. Erect single storey side (west) extension, and two storey rear extension. Raise roof, construct rear dormer, and install two front rooflights. New rear patio with steps.
Mr & Mrs Gore
OBSERVATION: No objection, subject to mitigation of any neighbours' concerns received regarding potential adverse impact on neighbour amenity, overlooking and loss of privacy (neighbour consultation letters had not been issued as at the date of this meeting).
- 6/2019/0703 **Advertisement Consent**
The Anchor Inn, 30-32 High Street, Swanage, BH19 2NU
Replacement of existing signage with illuminated and non-illuminated new signage.
Heineken
OBSERVATION: No objection. The Committee feels that the proposals will enhance the property.
- 6/2019/0704 **Listed Building Consent**
LISTED The Anchor Inn, 30-32 High Street, Swanage, BH19 2NU

Replacement of existing signage with illuminated and non-illuminated new signage.

Heineken

OBSERVATION: No objection. The Committee feels that the proposals will enhance the property.

Please note:

* The Town Council is Corporate Trustee of the De Moulham Trust, which holds the benefit of covenants in the properties that are the subject of applications marked *.

4) Applications for tree works - opportunity to raise any matters of concern

There were no matters raised.

Consultation

5) To note receipt of the following consultation document, and to determine the Council's preferred method of response, if any:

a) Dorset Council Draft Economic Growth Strategy 2020-2024 – public consultation

It was reported that Dorset Council was consulting on its draft Economic Growth Strategy 2020 to 2024. Sustainable economic growth was a key priority for the Council and the strategy had been designed to achieve this objective. The Council's headline priorities were: Place, People, Transportation – Infrastructure, Digital – Infrastructure, Business Environment, and Ideas/Motivation. The Council was therefore seeking the views of businesses on its vision and strategy via an online survey.

In answer to consultation questions, comments were made that Dorset Council should look to provide wider support to sectors it had identified as having growth potential to include tourism, which Members felt contributed significantly to Dorset's economy. Members were in agreement that congestion reduction and improved public transport, including access to education, were also vitally important to the town. Another priority for the Town Council was the delivery of a Low Carbon programme, and Dorset Council's planning and waste collection functions were highlighted as being the two services most likely to impact upon the Town Council's day to day business.

Committee Members completed the consultation survey during the discussion, and the answers were submitted online accordingly.

Councillor Finch left the Meeting at 8.45 p.m.

6) Items of Information and Matters for Forthcoming Agendas

a) Swanage Bay View Holiday Home Park (SBVHHP) - Model Standards 2008 for Caravan Sites in England – Caravan Sites and Control of Development Act 1960 – Section 5

Further to Minute No. 3 of the Planning and Consultation Committee Meeting held on 9th September 2019, it was reported that a response had been received from the Station Manager (South Dorset), Dorset & Wiltshire Fire and Rescue Service, regarding the concerns raised by the Town Council in relation to potential fire risks at the SBVHHP, and had enclosed a copy of the Model Standards 2008 for Caravan Sites in England, copies of which were provided with the agenda for information/future guidance purposes.

It was noted that the model standards represented the standards normally to be expected as a matter of good practice on caravan sites which contained caravans that were used as permanent residential units. The Station Manager had drawn attention to Section 2 iv) point c) of the document, which stated:-

- Any structure, including steps, ramps etc (except a garage or car port), which extends more than one metre into the separation distance shall be of non-combustible construction. There should be a 4.5 metre clear distance between any such structure and any adjacent caravan.

It was further noted that the Fire Safety Department had advised the Station Manager that, as there were no communal areas, this matter did not fall under the Fire Safety Order.

- b) Head of Planning, Dorset Council – invite to attend future Committee Meeting –** further to Minute No. 134 of the Council Meeting held on 25th November 2019 it was confirmed that letters had been sent to Dorset Council setting out the Town Council’s concerns regarding existing planning application consultation arrangements, the application approval process, and the timescale of the approval process of the submitted Purbeck Local Plan 2018-2034. No response had been received as yet. A discussion ensued during which a request was made for the Head of Planning, Dorset Council, to be invited to a future meeting of the Planning and Consultation Committee to provide the Committee with an opportunity to raise the Council’s concerns with the Head of Planning on a face-to-face basis and to undertake a ‘Q&A’ session.

7) Date of next Meeting

The date of the next meeting had been scheduled for Monday 3rd February 2020 at 6.30 p.m.

The meeting closed at 8.55 p.m.
